Environment Scrutiny Panel

PUBLIC MEETING

Record of Meeting

Date: 26th March 2009 Meeting Number: 5

Present	Deputy P Rondel (Chairman) (PR)	
	Deputy D Wimberley (Vice Chairman) (DW) (for items 2-6 only)	
	Connétable J Réfault (JR)	
Apologies		
In attendance	M Haden, M Orbell	

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
1	Records of Meetings	
	The minutes of the meeting of 3rd March 2009 were approved and signed.	МО
2	Matters arising	
	The action update report was noted.	
	Item 12 (a) The Panel recalled that it had declined the invitation to participate in a working group to review the Island's speed limits policy.	
3 Item 4	Energy from Waste Plant and Ramsar: Review of planning process	
03.03.09 514/9(8)	The Panel approved a letter to the Minister for Planning and Environment setting out the terms of reference for the review. It was agreed that a letter should be also drafted to the Ramsar Secretariat outlining the reasons for the Panel's review and asking whether any assistance may be available from the Secretariat.	МО
	The Scrutiny Officer outlined a revised timetable for this review.	
	The Panel noted that questions had been raised in the States regarding a discharge permit for brackish water arising from the EfW plant excavation. Related correspondence from Messrs G. Baudains and K. Shaw was also noted, together with a copy of a submission from Ms L. Luke to the Waste Regulator. Deputy Wimberley tabled a copy of the Official Analyst's report on the analysis of a sample of water collected in the pit on 11th February 2009 and a comparison with sea water collected on the same day. Concern was expressed about the apparent high content of heavy metals in comparison with the sea water sample; there was also some concern that the Panel was not informed of the matter directly by the Department but had to find out about it through the media.	
	The Panel recalled that there had also been a recent incident in which the membrane of one of the toxic ash pits was pierced last week. There was mention of potentially contaminated water escaping into a trench being dug for the EfW plant.	МН
	The Panel agreed to request the Transport and Technical Services	14111

	Department and the Waste regulator to provide urgent clarification in writing of the two separate matters, in particular the nature and source of the water from the toxic ash pit. The Panel noted the link between the above issues and the review of the environmental impact assessment. It recalled that a request for information on the testing regime and the records which were kept of results from seawater, marine organisms and the seabed in and around the Ramsar area had been included in its aforementioned letter to the Minister. It was agreed that it was essential to establish whether there was an adequate baseline against which it would be possible to monitor any effect that developments on the EFW site might have on local waters and marine life. The Panel requested its officers to press for this information.	MO
	The Panel noted Hazard data relating to the additives currently used in cooling waters at the JEC power station at la Collette. It requested its officer to undertake further research into the testing regime on these waters.	МО
	The Panel noted that Deputy Wimberley continued as a private member to raise a number of issues regarding the Energy from Waste Plant. Having discussed the matters, the Panel was reassured that issues within the remit of its review of the planning process and impact on the Ramsar site could be treated separately from other issues raised by the Deputy. The Panel requested that any information relevant to the planning process should be supplied to the Scrutiny Officers and that questions to the Department on this issue should be co-ordinated likewise through the Scrutiny Office.	DW
4	Energy efficiency in States Buildings	
Item 5 03.03.09 514/10(8)	The Panel considered a report from the Scrutiny Officer on an officer meeting with the Principal Buildings Service Engineer and the Energy Manager, Property Holdings. The report indicated a number of actions which could be taken to promote energy efficiency in States Buildings, in particular the example of an Environmental Case Study which was carried out at Howard Davis Farm in 2007. This audit had revealed that there was a potential to make savings in terms of electricity consumption and also water use amounting to a potential financial saving of £8,000 in the first year of the implementation of an action plan in return for a modest initial investment.	
	The Panel noted that a further officer meeting had been arranged with the Assistant Director, Environmental Policy, to discuss proposals to develop an environmental awareness campaign and further planned initiatives in reducing energy consumption and carbon emissions relating to States buildings.	
	The Panel requested that further research be undertaken into initiatives in the UK with regard to energy efficiency in buildings. There was some discussion of the possibility of using 'energy credits' to incentivise individual Departments to use less energy.	мн
5	Transport and Technical Services: Ministerial briefing	
	The Panel received the Minister, Assistant Minister and relevant officers (Director of Waste Management, Director of Transport, Director of Municipal Services, Finance Director and Street Works	

Manager in connexion with the following presentations on funding pressures facing the department and the recommendations of the Highways Authority law Review working group.

The Panel asked the Minister about the justification for the recent above inflation increase in the cost of parking cards. The Director of Transport explained that the planned increase had been reduced as the increase was based upon December RPI figures rather than September. The increase was not sufficient to maintain the level of the Car Park Trading Fund. The Minister said that it would be unfair to subsidise car parking by reducing the increase even further.

The Panel asked about cost recovery and measures within the proposed Highway maintenance law to encourage utility companies to arrange wayleaves across agricultural land rather than disturb the road surface. It was assured that such provisions had been included in the drafting instructions.

The Constable of St Peter raised the issue of the increase of P.30 vehicles, in particular large tractors, and the damage being caused to banks and the road surface.

The Panel congratulated the Minister on recently announced improvements to the bus service but asked if further improvements were planned for country routes. The Minister said that he was keen to develop the bus service but did not have funds to do so. He said it was important to reconsider the charging structure as part of the forthcoming review of the bus contract. He believed that there was a missing element in the current contract which would incentivise the company to provide a better service.

The Chairman raised concerns about the role of the Waterfront Enterprise Board and its control of facilities such as the Waterfront Car park and the Liberation Travel Centre. In this connexion the Panel noted that the Constable of St Peter had recently been appointed to the board of WEB and that he would therefore have to withdraw from any future discussions on this matter.

Issues identified for future questions to the Department included the maintenance of Bellozanne and arrangements for the disposal of asbestos.

MH/MO

Item 12(b) 03.03.09 514/1(3)

6

Draft Liquid Waste Strategy - peer review

The Panel considered the invitation from the Minister for Transport and Technical Services to participate in the planned challenge and peer review of the base data and assumptions of the draft Liquid Waste strategy. It concluded that it would be premature for the Panel to be involved at this stage of the development of the strategy - rather it should maintain its independent status in order to be able to take an objective view of the strategy and to act as a forum for public scrutiny. It was suggested that it would be more appropriate for the Panel to provide comment on the consultation document prior to its finalisation. The Panel agreed to request a further meeting with the Minister at a suitable time, which was likely to be in May or June. It was also noted that increasing use of 'satellite' treatment stations may be worth suggesting as a possibility for the future, to avoid the need for wholesale replacement of major plant.

МН

7.	Planning and Building Bye Laws		
Item 6 03.03.09 514/1(3)	The Panel recalled the concerns of Jersey Gas Limited regarding the implications of the adoption of a low carbon factor for imported electricity from France.		
	The Panel noted the Chairman's letter to the Minister for Planning and Environment, dated 20th March 2009, and agreed to invite submissions from the Jersey Electricity Company Limited and the Fuel Consortium.	мн	
	In addition, in view of the potential impact of this issue on the Energy market in Jersey, it was decided to seek the views of the Jersey Competition Regulatory Authority.	МН	
8	Topic proposal: temporary agricultural buildings		
514/1(3)	The Panel considered a proposal from Deputy C. Labey recommending a review of temporary agricultural structures, including polytunnels, portacabins and glasshouses, and the use of these structures after they have fulfilled their agricultural life.		
	The Panel agreed to raise this issue with the Minister for Planning and Environment at his next quarterly briefing meeting on 6th May 2009. Officers were asked to inform Deputy Labey and copy the information to Senator Breckon in his role as Chairman of the Health, Social Security and Housing Scrutiny Panel.	мн/мо	
9.	Draft States Strategic plan		
	The Panel considered a paper prepared by its officer regarding the Council of Minister's priorities relevant to the two Departments within its remit, as outlined in the Strategic Plan Green Paper.		
	The Chairman expressed the view that the draft Strategic plan was unsuitable in the current economic climate. He recalled that the Chairmen's Committee was due to meet the Council of Ministers to discuss the draft Plan on 23rd April 2009. It was agreed to defer further consideration of the draft Plan until after that meeting.		
10	Chairmen's Committee		
	The Panel received the briefing notes on the meeting held on 19th March 2009.		
11	Ministerial decisions		
	Recent ministerial decisions pertinent to the Panel's remit were noted.		
12	Questions to Ministers		
	It was noted that the Minister for Transport and Technical Services would answer questions without notice at the States sitting on 31st March 2009.		
13.	Date of next meeting: 23rd April 2009 at 8.30		
•			

	would answer questions without notice at the States sitting on 31st March 2009.		
13.	Date of next meeting: 23rd April 2009 at 8.30		
Signed		Date:	
Chairman Environment Panel			